

Testimony

of

**Professor Bradley L. Hardy
Associate Professor of Public Administration & Policy
School of Public Affairs
American University**

on the issue of

“Examining the SNAP Benefit Cliff”

before the

**U.S. House of Representatives Committee on Agriculture
Subcommittee on Nutrition, Oversight, and Department Operations**

July 12, 2021

Chairwoman Hayes, Ranking Member Bacon, and members of the Subcommittee on Nutrition, I thank you for the opportunity to appear before you today to discuss benefit cliffs in the Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program (SNAP) and related labor market challenges affecting low-income families. My name is Bradley Hardy. I am an Associate Professor of Public Administration and Policy at American University. Outside of my role as a professor at American, I hold several affiliations. I am a research affiliate of the *University of Wisconsin Institute for Research on Poverty*, the *University of Kentucky Center for Poverty Research*, and the *Institute for Economic Equity* at the *Federal Reserve Bank of St. Louis*. The views expressed here are my own, and do not represent official positions or policy viewpoints of any organizations with which I work or affiliate. For the past 15 years, I have conducted research on economic instability, intergenerational mobility, poverty policy, racial economic inequality, and socio-economic outcomes. My work has documented trends and sources of income volatility and intergenerational mobility within the United States, with a focus on socio-economically disadvantaged families, neighborhoods, and regions. This work includes research on the role of anti-poverty transfer programs such as SNAP, the earned income tax credit, and TANF for improving economic well-being among low-income individuals and families.

I have written twenty-five sole-authored or co-authored research studies, fifteen of which are published or forthcoming in peer-reviewed journals. I apply and share my expertise with a range of organizations concerned with poverty and economic well-being. I currently serve as a panel member of a *National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, Medicine Panel on Evaluation and Improvements to the Supplemental Poverty Measure*. I also serve as an advisory member for the *Aspen Institute Financial Security Program Benefits21 initiative*, and recently completed work on a year-long panel studying economic security in the United States for the *National Academy of Social Insurance*. I also serve as a co-editor at the *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management* and *Contemporary Economic Policy*.

My testimony is drawn primarily from my work on the interaction of SNAP with other social safety net programs, as well as on income volatility and the protective role of social safety net programs such as SNAP. I also draw upon my assessment of the broader research base surrounding these issues. There are several points I will highlight, and I expand upon these points in greater detail. To summarize:

- Conceptually, benefit cliffs are of concern for program participants who find themselves to be worse off “on the margin” when their earnings increase. SNAP benefit cliffs affect a relatively small number of participants, particularly once other social safety net programs are accounted for. In this way, these programs can combine to create a “net” marginal tax on earnings. In practice, these benefit cliffs are rare, and can be remedied. One important offset of the SNAP benefit cliff for working families are generous tax credits received via the earned income tax credit (EITC) and the child tax credit (CTC).
- SNAP and work participation are complementary. Many studies find that changes in the propensity to work—so-called labor supply elasticities—are fairly small. Most non-disabled adults on SNAP work. The decision to work is largely determined by inflexible forces, including involuntary job loss, disability status, age, and childcare coverage.

Relatedly, preliminary research on the effect of pandemic unemployment insurance suggests that UI generosity did not reduce employment.¹

- Families and children receiving SNAP face difficult labor market conditions. SNAP plays a critical role in supporting work at low-wages and providing a buffer against income volatility and joblessness.
- Further reducing any remaining SNAP benefit cliffs, many families receiving SNAP also benefit from generous child allowances enacted via tax credits within the American Rescue Plan, which could be made permanent via the American Families Plan. These credits could reduce child poverty by $\frac{1}{2}$.
- States have tools to reduce SNAP benefit cliffs. Many states have expanded SNAP benefits via broad based categorical eligibility, which extends benefits for low-income families who may otherwise lose benefits.

Low-Income Families and the Safety Net: SNAP and the EITC

Assessments of changes in worker well-being due to SNAP benefit cliffs should incorporate the full package of earnings and social safety net benefits that families on SNAP typically receive. In the instances where family incomes rise—leading to a reduction and/or subsequent loss in SNAP benefits, increased earnings and refundable tax credit payments represent a net-gain for most families. In my own co-authored work, I find that simultaneous participation in SNAP and the EITC doubled throughout the 2000s.² A similar relationship holds for many individuals who receive higher earnings via higher state minimum wages—the net effects of higher minimum wages alongside EITC benefits typically represent a net-gain for these individuals and their families.³ These benefits, along with higher earnings, will leave most families better off as earnings rise. This is especially so for families at very low earnings and low labor force attachment: in these instances, the EITC provides incentives for these families to enter into work. So, as it balances out, many households experience a negative marginal tax rate; the opposite of losing resources, they receive additional resources via tax credits that supplement their higher earned income.

It is also worth noting that the basic structure of SNAP reduces benefits less than dollar-for-dollar, another feature that helps to blunt the potential harm from a benefit cliff. In this sense, the SNAP benefit cliff is smooth, more akin to a hill. There are aspects of the safety net where benefit cliffs are starker—some state-level childcare subsidies loom large as an example. Other well-known safety programs that could ostensibly exacerbate benefit cliffs generally fail to do so, though for the unfortunate reason that relatively few poor families who qualify for benefits such as TANF and housing assistance actually receive these benefits. Over calendar year 2019, for every 100 poor families nationwide, roughly 23 received TANF cash assistance. Coverage varies greatly across states—8 out of 100 poor families receive TANF cash assistance in

¹ Altonji, J., Contractor, Z., Finamor, L., Haygood, R., Lindenlaub, I., Meghir, C., O'Dea, C., Scott, D., Wang, L. and Washington, E., (2020). Employment effects of unemployment insurance generosity during the pandemic.

² Hardy B, Smeeding T, Ziliak JP. (2018). The changing safety net for low-income parents and their children: Structural or cyclical changes in income support policy? *Demography*. 55(1):189-221.

³ Fahimullah, F., Geng, Y., Hardy, B., Muhammad, D. and Wilkins, J., (2019). Earnings, EITC, and Employment Responses to a \$15 Minimum Wage: Will Low-Income Workers Be Better Off? *Economic Development Quarterly*, 33(4), pp.331-350.

Alabama, while 34 out of 100 receive TANF cash assistance in Washington state.⁴ Similarly, only 1 in 5 families who qualify for housing assistance receive it.⁵ For example, a recent news account out of Miami-Dade County reported that roughly 90,000 applicants are vying to be one of 5,000 that will be placed on a list to receive housing vouchers.⁶

Work and Safety Net Participation Go Together

Most SNAP recipients are children, elderly, or disabled. Among the subset of adults receiving SNAP who can work, most elect to do so. Empirical evidence shows that SNAP is not a major determinant of decisions surrounding work participation and hours worked. Several studies find that these responses or “elasticities” of work to either higher earnings or safety net benefits are generally low.⁷ There are several reasons for this. First, the power to dictate scheduling tends to skew heavily towards firms and away from workers, especially within frontline and lower-wage employment opportunities. Thus, to the degree that the discussion of SNAP benefit cliffs is at all connected to concerns over work disincentives, there is not consistent empirical evidence to support this concern. Moreover, work decisions tend to be determined by other factors, including job mismatch, access to reliable transportation, disability status, and access to affordable childcare. A large proportion of non-disabled adult SNAP recipients work, and via work participation they receive a combination of federal and state EITC benefits, as well as CTCs. Empirical evidence demonstrates that features of the EITC create positive work incentives.⁸

Many families struggle to find pathways out of lower wage employment and, as a result, they persist on a combination of earnings alongside SNAP and EITC benefits.⁹ EITC receipt is conditioned on work participation, and in the absence of market employment, neither EITC nor SNAP—alone or together—would adequately cover food, clothing, shelter, transportation, and utility expenses that families typically face. Increased pandemic SNAP benefits, roughly an additional \$100 for a family of four,¹⁰ will help to reduce food hardship, but are inadequate to make up for lost employment. Relatedly, preliminary research suggests that UI generosity during the pandemic did not reduce employment.¹¹

Work Conditions Among Low-Income Families

The nature of work among low-income families typically yields income streams that are both low and volatile. Unstable, low-wage employment is strongly associated with higher income volatility and, accordingly, many socioeconomic groups that typically experience higher levels of joblessness report higher levels of income volatility. For example, families with lower

⁴ <https://www.cbpp.org/research/family-income-support/state-fact-sheets-trends-in-state-tanf-to-poverty-ratios>

⁵ <https://housingmatters.urban.org/research-summary/housing-choice-voucher-waiting-lists-disadvantage-households-facing-most>

⁶ <https://www.local10.com/news/local/2021/07/01/90000-applicants-only-5000-spaces-for-miami-dades-section-8-housing-and-no-guarantee/>

⁷ Keane, M.P., 2011. Labor supply and taxes: A survey. *Journal of Economic Literature*, 49(4), pp.961-1075.

⁸ Nichols, A., & Rothstein, J. (2016). “The earned income tax credit” In R. A. Moffitt (Ed.), *Economics of means-tested transfer programs in the United States* (Vol. 1, pp. 137-218). Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

⁹ Hardy, Smeeding, and Ziliak (2018)

¹⁰ <https://www.usda.gov/sites/default/files/documents/arp-national-factsheet.pdf>

¹¹ Altonji et al. (2020)

incomes and Black families of all incomes generally experience higher levels of income volatility as well as those with fewer formal educational credentials and those headed by one unmarried parent.¹² Such families appear to be saddled with an undesirable portfolio—economic resources and incomes that are both qualitatively low *and* unpredictable. This is largely a feature of the low-wage labor market, where workers change jobs more frequently and firms adjust work schedules frequently.¹³

SNAP, along with programs such as the EITC and unemployment insurance, combine to lower income volatility for low-income families. SNAP recipient families are more likely to transition in and out of work, and SNAP provides important nutritional support and near-cash benefits for these families and children. This support is linked to improved long-term socioeconomic outcomes for children within these households.¹⁴

The American Rescue Plan Further Reduces Existing Benefit Cliffs For Families

Many low-income families that benefit from SNAP will also receive child allowances from the American Rescue Plan (ARP). This plan will substantially reduce overall poverty, including significant reductions in child poverty across racial and ethnic minority groups. Poverty reducing policies in the ARP, including child tax credits from \$3,000 to \$3,600, alongside enhanced SNAP benefits and pandemic unemployment insurance, are forecasted to reduce poverty by 31 percent nationwide. This universal policy reduces racial economic inequality as well; Black poverty is forecasted to fall by 37 percent while Hispanic poverty is forecasted to fall by 40 percent. Poverty among Whites and Asians is forecasted to fall by roughly 24 percent. Poverty for White children could fall by 63 percent, followed by forecasted child poverty reductions for Black, Hispanic, and Asian children of 55, 53, and 46 percent, respectively.¹⁵ This expansion of the safety net further offsets the impacts of SNAP benefit cliffs. SNAP households *should* qualify for some, if not all, of the benefits of the ARP, especially refundable child tax credit payments.

Solutions to Assist Families Include Expansions of Safety Net Benefits Via Broad-Based Categorical Eligibility

Broad-based categorical eligibility (BBCE) can reduce rarely occurring benefit cliffs within SNAP. Such policy tools expand benefits to low-income families that experience modest income growth. BBCE extends benefits to families at the margin of qualifying for benefits. For households with incomes rising above 130 percent of the poverty line—\$2,353—BBCE enables states to raise SNAP's income limit to up to 200 percent of the poverty line. Unfortunately, only about 35 states take advantage of the option.

¹² Hardy, B.L., (2017). Income instability and the response of the safety net. *Contemporary Economic Policy*, 35(2), pp.312-330.

¹³ Schneider, D. and Harknett, K., (2019). Consequences of routine work-schedule instability for worker health and well-being. *American Sociological Review*, 84(1), pp.82-114.

¹⁴ Hoynes, H., Schanzenbach, D.W. and Almond, D., (2016). Long-run impacts of childhood access to the safety net. *American Economic Review*, 106(4), pp.903-34.

¹⁵ Parolin, Z., Collyer, S., Curran, M. and Wimer, C., (2021). The Potential Poverty Reduction Effect of the American Rescue Plan (No. 20411). Center on Poverty and Social Policy, Columbia University.

For example, a parent with two children working full time at \$13.50 an hour would have income at 129 percent of the poverty level, receiving roughly \$123 a month from SNAP. If her hourly wage increased by 50 cents—\$87 a month—raising her income slightly above 130 percent of poverty, the family becomes ineligible for SNAP. The loss of benefits would more than cancel out the increased earnings, and they lose approximately \$36 in total resources. In a state that raises the income cutoff via BBCE, this 50-cent raise would reduce the family's SNAP benefit by only \$31 per month, resulting in a monthly *net-increase* of about \$56 per month.

Overall, The Safety-Net is Largely Centered Around Work

No consistent body of empirical evidence shows that these programs reduce work. The safety net, including SNAP, provides crucial assistance for America's families. Over past several decades, many middle-skill jobs have been replaced by lower-paying employment opportunities.¹⁶ As such, many families benefit from a combination of SNAP and refundable tax credits,¹⁷ and most cannot realistically make ends meet without combining work with these safety net benefits. Given the weight of the social science evidence surrounding the long-term socioeconomic benefits of income receipt and poverty reduction for families and children, there are clear economic benefits associated with making the refundable child tax credit payments within the ARP permanent.¹⁸ These child allowances would help to support families and children that experience low, volatile incomes from job fluctuations, as well as expense volatility related to everyday household expenses, including medical expenses and car repairs.¹⁹ Still, even with the relatively generous tax credits within the ARP, families are forecasted to package work with these tax credits, using the additional income to pay down household expenses and meet day-to-day household needs.²⁰

¹⁶ Jaimovich, N. and Siu, H.E., (2020). Job polarization and jobless recoveries. *Review of Economics and Statistics* 102(1): 129-147.

¹⁷ Hardy, Smeeding, and Ziliak (2018)

¹⁸ Hardy, B., Hill, H.D. and Romich, J., (2019). Strengthening social programs to promote economic stability during childhood. *Social policy report*, 32(2), pp.1-36.

¹⁹ Morduch, J. and Schneider, R., 2017. *The financial diaries*. Princeton University Press.

²⁰ Tach, L., and Halpern-Meekin, S. (2014). Tax code knowledge and behavioral responses among EITC recipients: Policy insights from qualitative data. *Journal of Policy Analysis & Management* 33: 413-439.

BRADLEY L. HARDY

Summer 2021

Department of Public Administration and Policy
American University, School of Public Affairs
4400 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20016

E-mail: hardy@american.edu
Office Phone: (202) 885-3881
Website: www.bradleyhardy.com

Research fields

Labor Economics, Intergenerational Mobility, Income Volatility, Economics of Poverty, Social Welfare Policy

EDUCATION

Ph.D., Economics, University of Kentucky, Lexington, KY (August 2011)

M.S., Economics, University of Kentucky, Lexington, KY (December 2007)

M.P.P., Georgetown University, Washington, DC (May 2004)

B.A., Economics, magna cum laude, ΦBK, Morehouse College, Atlanta, GA (May 2002)

ACADEMIC, PROFESSIONAL, AND RESEARCH APPOINTMENTS

Department Chair Dept. of Public Administration and Policy <i>American University</i>	2020 - 2021
Director, Master of Public Policy (MPP) Program Dept. of Public Administration and Policy <i>American University</i>	2019 - 2020
Associate Professor, Dept. of Public Administration and Policy <i>American University</i>	2017 - Present
Assistant Professor, Dept. of Public Administration and Policy <i>American University</i>	2011 - 2017
Nonresident Senior Fellow, Economic Studies <i>The Brookings Institution</i>	2017 - Present
Research Fellow, Institute for Economic Equity <i>Federal Reserve Bank of St. Louis</i>	2018 - Present
Research Affiliate, Institute for Research on Poverty <i>University of Wisconsin-Madison</i>	2020 - Present

Research Affiliate, Center for Poverty Research <i>University of Kentucky</i>	2018 - Present
Visiting Scholar <i>Russell Sage Foundation</i>	2018 - 2019
Okun-Model Fellow in Economic Studies <i>The Brookings Institution</i>	2016 - 2017
Research Fellow <i>District of Columbia Office of Revenue Analysis</i>	May 2014 - Present
Faculty Fellow, Metropolitan Policy Center <i>American University</i>	2014 - Present
Faculty Associate, Political Theory Institute <i>American University</i>	2014 - Present
Visiting Scholar <i>U.S. Census Bureau</i>	January - June 2014
Visiting Scholar, Institute for Research on Poverty <i>University of Wisconsin-Madison</i>	March 2012

PROFESSIONAL APPOINTMENTS

Co-Editor, Contemporary Economic Policy, 2020-Present

Co-Editor, Journal of Policy Analysis and Management, 2020-Present

Editorial Board Member, Journal of Policy Analysis and Management, 2014-2016, 2016-Present

Editorial Board Member, Review of Black Political Economy, 2018-2020

Panel Member, National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, Medicine: Panel on Evaluation and Improvements to the Supplemental Poverty Measure, 2021-2022

Panel Member, National Academy of Social Insurance, Study Panel on Economic Security, 2019-2020

Elected Member, National Academy of Social Insurance, 2017-Present

Policy Council Member, Association for Public Policy Analysis and Management, 2019-Present

Executive Board Member, National Economic Association, 2012-2015, 2015-2018

Executive Board Member, Society of Government Economists, 2016-2019

PUBLICATIONS

Williams, Jhacova, Trevon D. Logan, and **Bradley Hardy**. "The Persistence of Historical Racial Violence and Political Suppression: Implications for Contemporary Regional Inequality." Forthcoming at *The ANNALS of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*.

Logan, Trevon, **Bradley Hardy**, and John Parman. 2021. "Long-run Analysis of Regional Inequalities in the US." *Oxford Review of Economic Policy* 37(1): 49–69.

Hardy, Bradley L., and Dave Marcotte. 2020. "Ties that Bind? Family Income Dynamics and Children's Post-Secondary Enrollment and Persistence." *Review of Economics of the Household*. 1-25. <http://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s11150-020-09516-9>

Fahimullah, Fahad, Yi Geng, **Bradley Hardy**, Daniel Muhammad, and Jeffrey Wilkins. 2019. "Earnings, EITC, and Employment Responses to a \$15 Minimum Wage: Will Low-Income Workers Be Better Off?" *Economic Development Quarterly* 33(4), 331-350. *2019 REMI George I. Treys Gold Award.

Hardy, Bradley L., Heather D. Hill, and Jennie Romich. 2019. "Strengthening Social Programs to Promote Economic Stability during Childhood." *SRCD Social Policy Report* 32(2).

Hardy, Bradley L., Rhucha Samudra, and Jourdan A. Davis. 2019. "Cash Assistance in America: The Role of Race, Politics, and Poverty." *The Review of Black Political Economy* 46(4): 306-324.

Casey, Marcus, and **Bradley L. Hardy**. 2018. "The Evolution of Black Neighborhoods Since Kerner." *RSF: The Russell Sage Foundation Journal of the Social Sciences* 4(6): 185–205.

Hardy, Bradley L., Timothy Smeeding, and James P. Ziliak. 2018. "The Changing Safety Net for Low Income Parents and Their Children: Structural or Cyclical Changes in Income Support Policy?" *Demography* 55(1): 189-221.

Andrews, Rodney, Marcus Casey, **Bradley L. Hardy**, and Trevon D. Logan. 2017. "Location Matters: Historical Racial Segregation and Intergenerational Mobility." *Economics Letters* 158: 67-72.

Hardy, Bradley L. 2017. "Income Instability and the Response of the Safety Net." *Contemporary Economic Policy* 35(2): 312-330. *CEP Best Article Award for 2017.

Brown-Robertson, LaTanya, Marcus Casey, **Bradley Hardy**, and Daniel Muhammad. 2016. "Does the EITC Buffer Against Neighborhood Transition? Evidence from Washington D.C.?" *American Economic Review: Papers and Proceedings* 106(5): 360-362.

Hardy, Bradley L. 2014. "Childhood Income Volatility and Adult Outcomes." *Demography* 51(5): 1641-1655.

Hardy, Bradley L., and James P. Ziliak. 2014. "Decomposing Rising Income Volatility: The 'Wild Ride' at the Top and Bottom." *Economic Inquiry* 52(1): 459-476.

Hardy, Bradley L. 2012. "Black Female Earnings and Income Volatility." *The Review of Black Political Economy* 39:465-75.

Ziliak, James P., **Bradley Hardy**, and Christopher Bollinger. 2011. "Earnings Volatility in America: Evidence from Matched CPS." *Labour Economics* 18(6): 742-754.

BOOK CHAPTERS AND POLICY REPORTS

Hardy, Bradley L., and Trevon D. Logan. 2020. "Racial Economic Inequality Amid the COVID-19 Crisis." The Hamilton Project Essay 2020-17: Brookings Institution, Economic Studies.

Hardy, Bradley L., and Dave E. Marcotte. 2020. "Education and the Dynamics of Middle-Class Status." Brookings Institution, Economic Studies.

Hardy, Bradley L., and Trevon D. Logan. 2020. "Race and the lack of intergenerational economic mobility in the United States" in *Vision 2020: Evidence for a Stronger Economy*. Washington Center for Equitable Growth.

Hardy, Bradley L., Trevon D. Logan, and John Parman. 2018. "The Historical Role of Race and Policy for Regional Inequality" in *Place-Based Policies for Shared Economic Growth*, Jay Shambaugh and Ryan Nunn (eds.), The Hamilton Project: Brookings Institution.

Hyra, Derek, Jocelyn Johnston, **Bradley Hardy**, and Meghan Doughty. 2015. "The Roadmap for the Washington Region's Economic Future: A State and Local Level Economic Development Policy Gap Analysis." AU Metropolitan Policy Center.

Ziliak, James P., Charles Hokayem, and **Bradley Hardy**. 2008. "Child Care Subsidies and the Economic Well-Being of Recipient Families: A Survey and Implications for Kentucky," Technical Report to Kentucky Youth Advocates and the Kentucky Cabinet for Health and Family Services.

WORKING PAPERS

Casey, Marcus D., **Bradley L. Hardy**, and Ene Ikpebe. 2021. "Childhood Environment and Mobility Outcomes in Appalachia." *Under Review*

Carr, Michael, and **Bradley L. Hardy**. 2021. "Racial Inequality Across Income Volatility & Employment." *Under Review*.

Hardy, Bradley, Charles Hokayem, and Stephen Roll. 2021. "Crashing Without a Parachute: Racial and Educational Disparities in Unemployment During COVID-19." *Under Review*.

Francis, Dania, **Bradley L. Hardy**, and Damon Jones. 2021. "Contributions of Black Economists to the Study of Public Finance, Education Policy, and Poverty Policy" *Under Review*.

Fisher, Jonathan, and **Bradley L. Hardy**. 2021. "Money Matters: Consumption Volatility Across the Income Distribution."

Davis, Jourdan, **Bradley Hardy**, Jocelyn Johnston, and Aeric A.H. Koerner. 2021. "Examining state social safety net choices: Are there linkages between EITC adoption and Medicaid policy?"

Casey, Marcus D., **Bradley L. Hardy**, Daniel Muhammad. 2020. "EITC Expansions, Gentrification, and Neighborhood Choice."

Despard, Mathieu, Michal Grinstein-Weiss, Stephen Roll, and **Bradley Hardy**. 2020. "Effects of an Online Tax-Time Saving Intervention and Deferral Choices Among Earned Income Tax Credit Recipients."

Darity, Jr., William, Darrick Hamilton, **Bradley Hardy**, and Jonathan Morduch. 2019. "Reinforcing Inequalities: Income Volatility and its Overlap with Wealth, Income, Race, and Ethnicity."

Hardy, Bradley L., and Seth Gershenson. 2016. "Parental Involvement and the Intergenerational Transmission of Educational Attainment."

RESEARCH IN PROGRESS

Labor Market and Income Responses to the Safety Net: Differences Across Demographics (2021)

Tax Policy and Freelance Employment (2020)

Educational Inequality and Economic Mobility Across Generations (2019)

POLICY BRIEFS AND SHORTER ARTICLES

Hardy, Bradley and James P. Ziliak. 2020. "Money, money, money: The fiscal response to COVID-19." <https://www.brookings.edu/blog/up-front/2020/03/24/money-money-money-the-fiscal-response-to-covid-19/>

Kent, Ana H., and Bradley Hardy. 2019. "Renter Households Face Trade-offs Choosing Amenities or Price." Federal Reserve Bank of St. Louis—*In the Balance* Series. <https://www.stlouisfed.org/publications/in-the-balance/2019/renter-tradeoffs-amenities-price>

Casey, Marcus, and Bradley L. Hardy. 2018. "50 years after the Kerner Commission report, the nation is still grappling with many of the same issues." <https://www.brookings.edu/blog/up-front/2018/09/25/50-years-after-the-kerner-commission-report-the-nation-is-still-grappling-with-many-of-the-same-issues/>

Casey, Marcus, and Bradley L. Hardy. 2018. "Reduced unemployment doesn't equal improved well-being for black Americans." <https://www.brookings.edu/blog/up-front/2018/02/15/reduced-unemployment-doesnt-equal-improved-well-being-for-black-americans/>

Hardy, Bradley L., and Nicholas Gaffney. 2017. "Fractured Factions: Labor Unions, the Rust Belt, and

- Black America.” Prepared for Real Clear Markets and Brookings.
<https://www.brookings.edu/opinions/fractured-factions-labor-unions-the-rust-belt-and-black-america/>
- Hardy, Bradley L. 2016. “Addressing Income Volatility in America: Flexible Policy Solutions for Changing Economic Circumstances.” Prepared for Washington Center for Equitable Growth.
<http://equitablegrowth.org/labor-markets/addressing-income-volatility-in-the-united-states-flexible-policy-solutions-for-changing-economic-circumstances/>
- Hardy, Bradley L. 2016, “TANF Policy to Address Low, Volatile Income Among Disadvantaged Families.” Prepared for Council on Contemporary Families.
<https://contemporaryfamilies.org/instability-safety-net/>
- Hardy, Bradley L. 2016. “Race and Income Volatility: A Discussion with Bradley Hardy.” Aspen Institute Financial Security Program. <https://www.aspeninstitute.org/blog-posts/interview-bradley-hardy-income-volatility-race/>. Reposted by The Brookings Institution at <https://www.brookings.edu/blog/up-front/2016/09/13/race-and-income-volatility-a-discussion-with-bradley-hardy/>
- Hardy, Bradley L. 2016. “Race and Income Volatility: A Discussion with Bradley Hardy.” Aspen Institute Financial Security Program. <https://www.aspeninstitute.org/blog-posts/interview-bradley-hardy-income-volatility-race/>. Reposted by The Brookings Institution at <https://www.brookings.edu/blog/up-front/2016/09/13/race-and-income-volatility-a-discussion-with-bradley-hardy/>
- Hardy, Bradley, James P. Ziliak, and Charles Hokayem. 2008. “The economic impact of child care subsidies for Kentucky,” University of Kentucky Center for Poverty Research Occasional Policy Brief No. 3. <http://www.ukcpr.org/Publications/PolicyInsights3.pdf>.
- Hardy, Bradley, Richard Kogan, and Arloc Sherman, and. 2005. “What Are The Effects of Cutting Domestic Appropriations Another Two Percent?” Center on Budget and Policy Priorities. <http://www.cbpp.org/10-31-05bud.htm>.
- Parrott, Sharon, Arloc Sherman, and Bradley Hardy. 2005. “House Budget Resolution Would Require Much Deeper Cuts In Key Low-Income Programs Than Senate Budget Plan: Depth and Breadth of Cuts a Key Issue in the Budget Resolution Conference,” Center on Budget and Policy Priorities. <http://www.cbpp.org/3-30-05bud.htm>.
- Parrott, Sharon, Jim Horney, Isaac Shapiro, Ruth Carlitz, Bradley Hardy, and David Kamin. 2005. “Where Would the Cuts Be Made Under the President’s Budget? An Analysis of Reductions in Education, Human Services, Environment, and Community Development Programs,” Center on Budget and Policy Priorities. <http://www.cbpp.org/2-22-05bud.htm>.

RESEARCH AND PROFESSIONAL EXPERIENCE

Research Assistant, University of Kentucky Center for Poverty Research, August 2007-June 2011

Teaching Assistant, Econometrics, AEA Summer Program and Minority Scholarship Program at Duke

University, Summer 2007

Research Assistant, Center on Budget and Policy Priorities, August 2004-June 2006

Research Assistant, Georgetown Public Policy Institute, August 2002-May 2003

CONFERENCES

Southern Economic Association Annual Meeting, November 20-22, 2021, Houston, Texas (invited presidential session organizer)

National Tax Association Annual Conference on Taxation, November 18-20, 2021, Detroit, Michigan (invited opening plenary panelist)

American Economic Association/Allied Social Sciences Meetings, January 3-5, 2021, Virtual via Zoom (discussant)

Association for Public Policy Analysis and Management Fall Research Conference, November 11-13, 2020, Virtual via Zoom (opening plenary panelist, presenter, discussant)

Association for Public Policy Analysis and Management Fall Research Conference, November 6-9, 2019, Denver, CO (presenter, discussant)

National Governors Association Policy Institute for Governors' Human Services Advisors, September 12, 2019, Chicago, IL (panelist)

Western Economic Association International, June 28-July 2, 2019, San Francisco, CA (presenter)

American Economic Association/Allied Social Sciences Meetings, January 4-6, 2019, Atlanta, GA (presenter)

HHS University of Wisconsin-Madison IRP Poverty Research and Policy Forum, September 25, 2018, Washington, DC (panelist)

50th Anniversary of the Kerner Commission Report National Conference, September 5-7, 2018, Minneapolis, MN (presenter)

Poverty States: Federalism, Rights, and State Anti-Poverty Efforts, American University, March 23-24, 2018 (presenter)

American Economic Association/Allied Social Sciences Meetings, January 4-7, 2017, Philadelphia, PA (presenter, discussant)

National Association for Welfare Research and Statistics, July 31, 2017, Pittsburgh, PA (lunchtime plenary panelist)

EdLoC Conference, April 26-28, 2017, Chicago, IL (presenter)

American Economic Association/Allied Social Sciences Meetings, January 6-8, 2017, Chicago, IL

(presenter)

Association for Public Policy Analysis and Management International Conference, November 3-5, 2016, Washington, D.C. (presenter, discussant)

Association for Public Policy Analysis and Management International Conference, June 13-14, 2016, London, England (presenter, discussant)

Society of Government Economists Annual Conference, May 13, 2016, Washington, D.C. (presenter)

Association for Public Policy Analysis and Management Spring Research Conference, April 8-9, 2016, Washington, D.C. (panel moderator)

National Academy of Social Insurance 28th Annual Policy Research Conference, "Disparate Income, Wealth, and Opportunity: Implications for Social Insurance." Pre-Conference Panel: Assuring Income Security for Children and Parents: The Role Social Insurance and Assistance Today. January 27, 2016 (presenter)

American Economic Association/Allied Social Sciences Meetings, January 3-5, 2016, San Francisco, CA (presenter, discussant)

Association for Public Policy Analysis and Management Fall Research Conference, November 12-14, 2015, Miami, Florida (presenter)

Western Economic Association International, June 28-July 2, 2015, Honolulu, HI (presenter)

Indiana University School of Public and Environmental Affairs Conference, Federal, State, and Local Budgets in Jeopardy: A Conference on America's Fiscal Future, April 30-May 2, 2015, Bloomington, IN (presenter)

American Society for Public Administration, March 7, 2015, Chicago, IL (presenter)

National Tax Association Annual Conference on Taxation, November 13-15, 2014, Santa Fe, NM (presenter)

Association for Public Policy Analysis and Management Fall Research Conference, November 6-8, 2014, Albuquerque, NM (presenter, discussant)

American Economic Association/Allied Social Sciences Meetings, January 3-5, 2014, Philadelphia, PA (presenter, session chair, discussant)

Association for Public Policy Analysis and Management Fall Research Conference, November 7-9, 2013, Washington, DC (presenter)

University of Kentucky Center for Poverty Research/University of Wisconsin Institute for Research on Poverty Joint Conference, Five Decades of Food Stamps, September 20, 2013, Washington, DC (participant)

National Association for Welfare Research and Statistics Annual Workshop, August 18-20, 2013,

Chicago, IL (presenter)

Duke University DITE SSRI Conference, February 21-23, 2013, Durham, NC (presenter)

Southern Economic Association Annual Conference, November 16-18, 2012, New Orleans, LA (presenter)

Association for Public Policy Analysis and Management Fall Research Conference, November 9, 2012, Baltimore, MD (presenter, discussant)

U.S. Dept. of Health and Human Services Welfare Research and Evaluation Conference, June 1, 2012 Washington, DC (presenter)

Duke University DITE SSRI Conference, May 23-25, 2012, Durham, NC (presenter)

American Economic Association/Allied Social Sciences Meetings, January 6-8, 2012, Chicago, IL (presenter)

Southern Economic Association Annual Conference, November 19-21, 2011, Washington, DC (discussant)

Association for Public Policy Analysis and Management Fall Research Conference, November 4, 2011, Washington, DC (presenter, discussant)

Bennett College, Conference on The Status of and Challenges Facing Black Women, March 18-19, 2011, Greensboro, NC (presenter)

Southern Economic Association Annual Conference, November 22, 2010, Atlanta, GA (presenter)

Association for Public Policy Analysis and Management Fall Research Conference, November 4-6, 2010, Boston, MA (presenter)

Kentucky Economic Association Conference, September 24, 2010, Frankfort, KY (presenter)

American Economic Association Summer Pipeline Conference at the University of California-Santa Barbara, August 7-8, 2010, Santa Barbara, CA (presenter)

National Bureau of Economic Research Summer Institute, July 27-29, 2010, Boston, MA (participant)

University of Kentucky Center for Poverty Research Brownbag Research Series, Spring 2009, Lexington, KY (presenter)

American Economic Association Summer Pipeline Conference at the University of California-Santa Barbara, August 2009, Santa Barbara, CA (participant)

14th Annual University of Kentucky Economics Teaching Workshop, March 28, 2009, Lexington, KY (Participant)

INVITED PRESENTATIONS AND LECTURES

University of Michigan Panel Study of Income Dynamics Research Seminar, May 20, 2021 (invited)

Columbia University Center on Poverty and Social Policy Annual Conference, Keynote Speaker, May 13, 2021 (invited)

Columbia University School of Social Work, Post-Election Panel, November 10, 2020

Harvard University Inequality and Social Policy Program, 5 Big Ideas in Inequality, November 9, 2020

Brookings Institution, Hamilton Project, Black Households & COVID-19: Impediments to Economic Security, August 13, 2020

University of Wisconsin Institute for Research on Poverty Webinar on Poverty and COVID19, July 15, 2020

Brookings Institution, Economic Studies - Future of Middle-Class Initiative Webinar: higher education, equity, and access, May 19, 2020

Brookings Institution, Economic Studies - Future of Middle-Class Initiative, December 13, 2019

University of Vermont, Florence Davis Deane Lecture, Department of Economics, October 16, 2019

West Virginia University, Department of Economics, October 4, 2019

New College of Florida, Department of Economics, May 6, 2019

Rutgers University, Department of Economics, April 5, 2019

New York University, Wagner Graduate School of Public Service, April 4, 2019

University of Michigan, Center for Local, State, and Urban Policy, March 20, 2019

University of Wisconsin-Madison, La Follette School of Public Affairs & Institute for Research on Poverty, Keynote Address on 50th Anniversary of the Kerner Commission on Civil Disorders, March 11, 2019 (invited)

DC Government Lab @ DC Lunch Series, September 26, 2018

American Enterprise Institute, Economic success for black men in America, June 26, 2018

University of Washington, Evans School of Public Policy and Governance, April 6, 2018

Williams College, November 16, 2017

RAND Corporation Santa Monica, June 5, 2017

University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, Department of Public Policy, March 3, 2017

Georgetown University, McCourt School of Public Policy, January 26, 2017

University of California-Berkeley Institute for Research on Labor and Employment, November 30, 2016

Washington Center for Equitable Growth, October 13, 2016

Brookings Institution - Economic Studies Seminar, March 8, 2016

George Washington University, Trachtenberg School of Public Policy and Public Administration,
January 21, 2016

University of Massachusetts – Boston, Department of Economics, December 3, 2015

Catholic University of America, “Sociology, Policy Analysis, and Public Service: Pipelines to Applied
Research & Civic Engagement,” October 1, 2015 (invited panel discussant)

University of New Mexico, American Economic Association Summer Training Program, July 17, 2015
(invited lecture)

University of California Davis Center for Poverty Research, May 18-21, 2015, Davis, CA
(invited visiting scholar)

American University Metropolitan Policy Center Lecture Series, March 24, 2015

University of Kentucky, Department of Economics Mark C. Berger Seminar, October 10, 2014

United Way of the National Capital Area, *Trends in Poverty and Education*, March 12, 2014,
Washington, DC (invited lecture)

Washington and Lee University, Department of Economics Seminar, January 31, 2014, Lexington, VA

Bowie State University, Department of Economics – Omicron Delta Epsilon Chapter, December 13,
2013, Bowie, MD (invited lecture)

University of Wisconsin-Whitewater, *Moving the African American Community from Poverty to
Prosperity*, December 4, 2012, Whitewater, WI (invited lecture)

Institute for Research on Poverty, University of Wisconsin-Madison, March 15, 2012, Madison, WI

Howard University Department of Economics Seminar, February 16, 2012, Washington, DC

American University, Osher Lifelong Learning Series, *U.S. Poverty and Social Policy Trends*, October
13, 2011, Washington, DC (invited lecture)

Mathematica Policy Research, December 15, 2010, Washington, DC (presenter)

American University Department of Public Administration and Policy, December 3, 2010,
Washington, DC

Western Kentucky University Department of Economics Seminar, October 1, 2010, Bowling Green, KY

University of Kentucky Department of Economics Seminar, September 29, 2010, Lexington, KY

COURSES TAUGHT

PUAD 685 **Social Policy**, American University: Spring 2012, Spring 2013, Spring 2015, Spring 2016, Spring 2018, Spring 2020

PUAD 630 **Public Managerial Economics**, American University: Fall 2011, Spring 2012, Fall 2012, Spring 2013, Spring 2015, Fall 2015, Spring 2016, Fall 2017, Spring 2020

PUAD 770 **Economics for Policy Analysis (Doctoral-Level)**, American University: Fall 2019, Fall 2020

Brookings Institution Executive Education, **Combating Poverty**, March 17, 2018

PUAD 670 **Economics for Policy Analysis**, American University: Fall 2013, Fall 2014

PUAD 790 **Special Topics in Poverty and Social Policy**, American University, Fall 2013

ECON-690-001 **Income Shocks and Criminal Activity**, American University, Fall 2016

ECO 391 **Economic and Business Statistics**, University of Kentucky, Summer 2009

ECO 202 **Introductory Macroeconomics**, University of Kentucky, Summer 2008

Doctoral Dissertation Committees (*DPAP* denotes internal doctoral student, *ECON* denotes AU economics department doctoral student)

Ene Ikpebe (Chair, In-Progress, DPAP), Stephan Lefebvre (Committee Member, ECON, 2020), Courtney Kemp (Committee Member, Brandeis U, In-progress), Arianne Volk (Committee Member, ECON, 2020), Chase Daniel (Committee Member, DPAP, 2019), Rhucha Samudra (Co-Chair, 2016, DPAP), Chad Smith (Committee Member, 2016, DPAP), Manuel Buitrago (Committee Member, 2015, ECON)

SERVICE

Aspen Institute Financial Security Program, Benefits21 Leadership **Advisory Group Member**, 2020-Present

National Academy of Social Insurance, Study Panel on Economic Security, **Study Panel Member**, 2019-2020

American University, Department of Public Administration and Policy Postdoctoral Search Committee, **Chair**, 2020

Population Association of America Annual Meeting **Session Organizer**, 2021

Association for Public Policy Analysis and Management Fall Research Conference **Program Committee**, 2018, 2020

American Economic Association Committee on the Status of Minority Groups in the Economics Profession, **Mentor**, 2020-Present

University of Wisconsin-Madison Center for Financial Security Junior Scholar Intensive Training (JSIT), **Mentor**, 2020

Population Association of America Diversity and Inclusion Task Force, **Member**, 2018-2020

Peterson Foundation US 2050 Initiative, **Advisory Board Member**, 2017-Present

American University, School of Public Affairs, **SPA Dean Search Committee Co-Chair**, 2017

American University, School of Public Affairs **Education Policy Curriculum Committee**, 2013-2016

American University, Department of Public Administration and Policy MPP Admissions Committee, **Member**, 2011-2013

American University, Department of Public Administration and Policy Post-Doctoral Program Search Committee, **Member**, 2012-Present

American University, Department of Public Administration and Policy PhD Admissions Committee, **Member**, 2011-2012, 2014-Present

American University, **NASPAA Reaccreditation Committee**, 2015

American University, **William K. Reilly Scholarship Selection Committee**, 2014-Present

American University, **Frederick Douglass Distinguished Scholars Program**, Invited Speaker, November 10, 2011

PROFESSIONAL ACTIVITIES

Peer Review and Referee for: Journal of Policy Analysis and Management, Demography, Economics of Education Review, Journal of Human Resources, Health Economics, Review of Black Political Economy, Economic Development Quarterly, Southern Economic Journal, Social Science Quarterly, Columbia University Press, National Institute of Environmental Health Sciences, Economic Inquiry, Sociology of Education, Journal of Family and Economic Issues, Journal of Population Economics, Child Development, BMJ Global Health, Social Service Review, Demographic Research, Social Forces, Journal of Economic Inequality, Youth and Society, United States-Israel Binational Science Foundation

Member: American Economic Association, National Economic Association, Association for Public Policy Analysis and Management, Society of Government Economists

SELECT MEDIA

Women's Wear Daily, "One Year In: The Pandemic's Labor Impact By the Numbers." March 15, 2021.

Deacon Herald, "Biden plan a powerful change for poor US children." March 11, 2021.

Time, "Another Round of Stimulus Checks Is Coming But Some Families May Fall Through the Cracks." March 3, 2021.

NPR, "With One Move, Congress Could Lift Millions of Children Out Of Poverty." February 26, 2021.

Washington Post, "Black households were saving more. Then came COVID-19." December 1, 2020.
(references Hardy and Logan 2020 Brookings Hamilton Project Report)

Wall Street Journal, "Disparity in Jobless Rates Suggests Black Workers Face Slower Recovery.",
November 29, 2020.

Nonprofit Quarterly, "As Federal Aid Disappears, US Poverty Rapidly Grows and Deepen.", October
19, 2020.

Forbes, "Here's What The Last Jobs Report Before The Presidential Election Means For Voters.",
October 2, 2020.

Morningstar, "U.S. Jobless Claims Held Steady at 860K in Sept. 12 Week — Update.", September 17,
2020.

Forbes, "Here's What The Last Jobs Report Before The Presidential Election Means For Voters",
October 2, 2020.

CBS News, "Coronavirus is third biggest cause of death among Black Americans, experts say." August
17, 2020.

NPR, "Riots That Followed Anti-Racism Protests Come At Great Cost To Black-Owned Businesses."
August 12, 2020.

New York Times, "Black Families Were Hit Hard by the Pandemic. The Effects on Children May Be
Lasting." July 1, 2020.

Business Insider, "Prominent economists outline 5 ways to start rooting out systemic racism and make
the American dream a reality for all." June 18, 2020.

Wall Street Journal, "Coronavirus Obliterated Best African-American Job Market on Record." June 16,
2020.

MSNBC - The Last Word, "Economic impact of pandemic on minority and low-income communities."
June 12, 2020.

Vox, "The pandemic job divide: Those who can stay safe at home, and those who can't." June 12, 2020.

Associated Press, "Behind virus and protests: A chronic US economic racial gap." June 8, 2020.
Reprinted in outlets including:

Yahoo! Finance, "The case for monthly coronavirus stimulus checks: Americans 'need consistent liquidity'." May 11, 2020.

Vox, "The debate about whether expanded unemployment insurance is too generous, explained." April 28, 2020.

Agence France-Presse (AFP), "Coronavirus Reveals, Exacerbates US Inequality." April 4, 2020.

Wall Street Journal, "After 40 Years, the Black-White Labor Force Participation Gap Has All But Closed." March 11, 2018

Interview on Time Warner Cable News, "Unemployment Report Offers Mixed Message About State of American Jobs." September 4, 2015

Interview on Time Warner Cable News, "As Long-Term Unemployed Numbers Drop, House Benefits Bill Stalls." August 6, 2014

Interview on Time Warner Cable News, "Lawmakers Have Little To Show As New Sequestration Deadline Nears." November 27, 2013

Podcast, Institute for Research on Poverty, University of Wisconsin-Madison

SELECT GRANTS AND HONORS

WorkRise-Urban Institute grant award, "Cash and Near-Cash Safety Net Programs and Labor Market Outcomes," (PI) 2021-2022. \$119,890.

Institute for Research on Poverty (IRP) Extramural Small Grants program for Research on the Geography of Opportunity (PI). \$25,000.

2019 REMI George I. Treyz Gold Award, "Earnings, EITC, and Employment Responses to a \$15 Minimum Wage: Will Low-Income Workers Be Better Off?" *Economic Development Quarterly*.

American University Student Government Faculty of the Year Award, 2017-2018.

2017 Best Article Award, "Income Instability and the Response of the Safety Net," *Contemporary Economic Policy*.

Washington Center for Equitable Growth, 2017, The Historical Shadow of Segregation on Human Capital and Upward Mobility, (Co-PI). \$75,000.

University of Kentucky Center for Poverty Research Grant Initiative, "Understanding the Relationships between SNAP, Food Security, and Health in the National Health Interview Survey." (Co-PI), 2015. \$75,000.

National Economic Association President's Award for Service, 2015.

W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research, Early Career Research Grant, 2014-2015. \$5,000.

Washington Center for Equitable Growth, 2014. \$10,000.

Special Sworn Status, U.S. Census Bureau, 2014-2018.

Smith Richardson Foundation, "Building Human Capital and Economic Potential," 2013-2014. \$5,000.

American University SPA Scholars Faculty Development Award, 2013-2014. \$5,000.

Southern Regional Education Board Doctoral Scholar, 2007-2011.

University of Kentucky Lyman T. Johnson Fellow, 2006-2011.

AEA Summer Program Participant and Minority Scholarship Recipient, 2002 & 2004.

Phi Beta Kappa - Delta of Georgia at Morehouse College, May 2002.

Top Ranking Senior Student in Economics, Morehouse College, May 2002.

Truth in Testimony Disclosure Form

In accordance with Rule XI, clause 2(g)(5)* of the *Rules of the House of Representatives*, witnesses are asked to disclose the following information. Please complete this form electronically by filling in the provided blanks.

Committee: Agriculture

Subcommittee: Nutrition, Oversight, and Department Operations

Hearing Date: 07/12/2021

Hearing Title :

"Examining the SNAP Benefit Cliff"

Witness Name: Bradley L. Hardy

Position/Title: Associate Professor

Witness Type: ☐ Governmental ☒ Non-governmental

Are you representing yourself or an organization? ☒ Self ☐ Organization

If you are representing an organization, please list what entity or entities you are representing:

Nongovernmental witness representing self

FOR WITNESSES APPEARING IN A NON-GOVERNMENTAL CAPACITY

Please complete the following fields. If necessary, attach additional sheet(s) to provide more information.

Are you a fiduciary—including, but not limited to, a director, officer, advisor, or resident agent—of any organization or entity that has an interest in the subject matter of the hearing? If so, please list the name of the organization(s) or entities.

No

Please list any federal grants or contracts (including subgrants or subcontracts) related to the hearing's subject matter that you, the organization(s) you represent, or entities for which you serve as a fiduciary have received in the past thirty-six months from the date of the hearing. Include the source and amount of each grant or contract.

Not applicable

Please list any contracts, grants, or payments originating with a foreign government and related to the hearing's subject that you, the organization(s) you represent, or entities for which you serve as a fiduciary have received in the past thirty-six months from the date of the hearing. Include the amount and country of origin of each contract or payment.

Not applicable

Please complete the following fields. If necessary, attach additional sheet(s) to provide more information.

- ☒ I have attached a written statement of proposed testimony.
- ☒ I have attached my curriculum vitae or biography.

* Rule XI, clause 2(g)(5), of the U.S. House of Representatives provides:

(5)(A) Each committee shall, to the greatest extent practicable, require witnesses who appear before it to submit in advance written statements of proposed testimony and to limit their initial presentations to the committee to brief summaries thereof.

(B) In the case of a witness appearing in a non-governmental capacity, a written statement of proposed testimony shall include— (i) a curriculum vitae; (ii) a disclosure of any Federal grants or contracts, or contracts, grants, or payments originating with a foreign government, received during the past 36 months by the witness or by an entity represented by the witness and related to the subject matter of the hearing; and (iii) a disclosure of whether the witness is a fiduciary (including, but not limited to, a director, officer, advisor, or resident agent) of any organization or entity that has an interest in the subject matter of the hearing.

(C) The disclosure referred to in subdivision (B)(iii) shall include— (i) the amount and source of each Federal grant (or subgrant thereof) or contract (or subcontract thereof) related to the subject matter of the hearing; and (ii) the amount and country of origin of any payment or contract related to the subject matter of the hearing originating with a foreign government.

(D) Such statements, with appropriate redactions to protect the privacy or security of the witness, shall be made publicly available in electronic form 24 hours before the witness appears to the extent practicable, but not later than one day after the witness appears.